

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 27, 2018

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Robbie Cangelosi

Members absent: Cynthia Dubberley

**I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the February 20, 2018 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Robbie Cangelosi arrived.

2. 2315 Laurel St.

Application: Samuel Bavidio, applicant; Michael Gunaldo, owner; Construct side gallery to existing two family, residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2270 St. Claude Ave.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; 1024 Mandeville LLC, owner; Design modifications to ARC conceptually approved plans for a mixed-use development to include a new gallery following the demolition of the existing two-story vacant commercial building and Victorian cottage.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposed modifications to the conceptually approved plans with the recommendations of the ARC and details to be worked out at Staff Level. The ARC agreed the projecting stairs at the first level were not successful and recommended removing them from the public right of way and shifting them back into the interior of the building. The ARC stated the post locations at the gallery will need to be confirmed with the subsurface utilities and any changes need to be reviewed and approved by the HDLC. They agreed the awnings

appear high and recommended lowering them. The ARC also recommended an additional submittal of the rooftop equipment to Staff to determine visibility.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 3700 Canal St.

Application: Heather Little, applicant; Rectors Wardens And Vestrymen Of Grace Church, owner; Renovation of an existing Landmark church and rectory to include the construction of a residential care center three-story addition.

Speakers: Doody Lester, Marie Olagues, Mary Mysing, Buddy Lester, and Mary Howell spoke against the application. Bishop Morris Thompson spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to approve the application.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Failed

In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed: Robbie Cangelosi

Motion: Elliott Perkins made the motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed the revised scale is much more in keeping with property, respects the Landmark church building, and relates better to the neighborhood context. The ARC agreed the Cleveland Avenue elevation requires further refinement with regard to the streetscape. They suggested stepping the mass back at the third level to better align with the neighboring residential buildings. The ARC suggested rotating some of the units as a strategy to accomplish this. They also recommended modifications of the articulation the porch to better integrate it into the streetscape, i.e. changing the hand rails to an open rail vs a glass rail, changing the windows to bay windows, increasing the verticality of the windows, wrapping the corner walls to make the porch appear more open, and adding planters at the pedestrian level. With regard to materiality, the ARC agreed additional brick should be added to the elevations to create more of a balance between the two materials as it relates to the Landmark church. The ARC requested additional study and schemes of the recommended setback at Cleveland Avenue as well as a series of studies of the relationship of the two exterior materials as they relate to the historic church.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 2627 Tchoupitoulas St.

Application: John Lambertson, applicant; Tchoup Party Stop LLC, owner; Demolition of three (3) existing one-story warehouse buildings and new construction of a five-story, self-storage facility.

Speakers: Brittany Kennedy, Harvey Stern, and Thomas P Mcalister spoke against the application.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the rotated office building engaged within the larger structure was a more successful than the original iteration. The one story portion should be further integrated with the building, instead of looking like a later addition. The front wall of the building should align with the larger structure and the articulation should run across the entire façade. The way the buildings touch will need to be further studied. Cornices should be simplified at both structures. The area above the windows at the one story portion should be brick instead of hardi panels. All the hardi on the building should be smooth panels, lap siding would not be appropriate. The residential style windows need to be reconfigured to match the commercial warehouse style, these windows do not need to be centered in the bay. Overall the building elevations, and integration of the one story office structure needs to be studied within the context.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 2400 St Charles St.

Application: M Carbine Restorations, Ltd, applicant; The Saint Charles Avenue Condominium LLC, owner; Review facade changes of previously approved four-story, multi-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The glass to wall ratio and the addition of outdoor space for the units, are an improvement from the initial proposal. The ARC agreed that some of the detailing could use simplifying. They would like to see some 3-D perspectives of the building to better understand some of the changes.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 4920 St Charles Ave.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

8. 527 First St.

Application: Ronald Francis Jouandot, applicant; Livewell Properties LLC, Livewell Properties LLC, owner; New construction of three-story, single family, residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

- Windows at the front should be drawn accurately as 6/9 full height windows, with uneven sashes.
- The recessed entry needs to be removed or studied to be more accurate.
- Porch needs to be deeper at the front elevation.
- The staggered windows at the stair should be one unit, and higher on the wall.
- The dormer is detailed incorrectly, the sill should be lowered and the width should be narrower.
- The cornice at the top of the building is not accurate.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 1355 Magazine St.

Application: Kyle Hamm, applicant; Anne Y Stoltze, Valence Properties LLC, owner; New construction of 2,703 SF single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please submit one set of final detailed drawings reflecting the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 1353 Magazine St.

Application: Mitchell Turnbough, applicant; Magazine Lp 1351, owner; New construction of three-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please submit one set of final detailed drawings reflecting the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 937 Thrd St.

Application: Edward Fleming, applicant; Christopher T Dodd, owner; Renovate existing two-story, single-family residential building and construct two-story side addition.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proportions of the gallery were much improved. The cornices over the French doors at the side elevation should be removed. The porch overhang at the side entrance should not wrap the corner of the addition, it should align with the wall. The gate detail needs to be further studied, it may need to notch into the new porch condition.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 3319 St Claude St.

Application: Jeffrey E Treffinger, applicant; 3319 St Claude LLC, owner; Construction of 500 SF addition to an existing commercial building

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 514 Franklin Ave.

Application: Jeffrey E Treffinger, applicant; Primmoz Abs LLC, owner; New construction of 32,000 SF mixed-use building.

Speakers: Bob Freilich spoke in favor of the application. Jerry L Edgar spoke against the application.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed the massing of the new structure does not align with the context and recommended shifting the mass toward the industrial streetscape of Franklin Avenue rather than the residential context at the rear and left side of the parcel. The ARC suggested modifying the layout into more of an L-shape, positioned partly over or behind the existing structure and turning toward Franklin Ave at the parking lot, to remove the mass from Decatur Street. The ARC also recommended investigating 'green wall' strategies at the uptown facing wall to incorporate an additional layer of fabric between the balconies of the new structure and the neighboring residential buildings. The ARC requested additional massing and block studies with the revised proposal, the incorporation of the historic context into the renderings and model, as well as additional perspective views that clearly illustrate the new structure and historic context.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 817 N Villere St.

Application: Natalie Deliso, applicant; Schoen Fuselier Co. LLC, owner; Construction of new two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application pending resubmission of a revised proposal. The overall composition of the proposal should be reevaluated. The ARC recommends having the front door on the porch and making the front porch accessible. The details of the roof overhang should be reworked, as the current detailing does not work. The ARC also noted that there must be 18' behind the façade of the house for a car to park. The ARC suggests that the applicant submits 3D views of the proposals at 817 and 819 N Villere together.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 819 N Villere St.

Application: Natalie Deliso, applicant; Schoen Fuselier Co LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application pending resubmission of a revised proposal. The overall composition of the proposal should be reevaluated. The ARC recommends having the front door on the porch and making the front porch accessible. The details of the roof overhang should be reworked, as the current detailing does not work. The ARC also noted that there must be 18' behind the façade of the house for a car to park. The ARC suggests submitting 3D views of the proposals at 817 and 819 N Villere together.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 1308 Henriette Delile St.

Application: Lewis Robinson, applicant; William Casey Frew, owner; Construction of accessory service building at rear.

Speakers: Rene Franser spoke neutrally about the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 826 N Robertson St.

Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

18. 3013 Chartres St.

Application: Joseph Carlson, applicant; Hazel R Laborde, Hazel R Laborde, owner; New Construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer the application and made the following recommendations:

- Present a more detailed context drawing which includes the adjacent building window and door pattern in order to better understand the proposed building's relationship to the context. The window to wall proportion of the proposal does not appear to properly address the context.
- Develop the entry further. Include a handrail and more defined entry sequence.
- Reduce the depth of the front balcony over the public right of way to match the depth of the entry stairs below.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 3015 Chartres St.

Application: Joseph Carlson, applicant; Glen G Laborde, Glen G Laborde, owner; 1,250 SF camelback addition to an existing multi-family residential recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level I building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Add windows on the street facing wall of the camelback addition.
- Simplify ornamental iron handrails.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 823 N Robertson St.  
Application: Maged Algharably, applicant; Lambert C Jr Boissiere, owner; Construction of new one-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application pending resubmission of a revised proposal. The ARC stated that the proposal as currently designed is not successful. The architectural detailing is not cohesive. The ARC stated that the parking in front of the building should be removed and that the applicant should determine the required front yard setback in the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.  
Second: Robbie Cangelosi  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
21. 1382 Camp St.  
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of 2538 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.  
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please make sure the column and window trim are drawn accurately. The front entrance should be a single pane over panel door.  
Second: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
22. 1241 Louisa St.  
Application: Marla Fontes, applicant; First Choice Housing LLC, owner; New construction 1874 SF single-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: Robert Cangelosi made a motion to defer an action on this application due to lack of representation at the meeting.  
Second: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
23. 2926 Chippewa St.  
Application: 2926 Chippewa St: Alison Rex, applicant; Richard Ziegler, owner; Construct 1,602 SF addition to existing camelback, single-family residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the proposed addition overwhelmed the existing historic shotgun building. The bridge condition, exterior stair and roof form are overly complicated and should be simplified.  
Second: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:

24. 826 N Robertson St.

Comments: This was item was withdrawn due to lack of representation.

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.